Study on the tribological properties of plasma nitrided bearing steel under lubrication with borate ester additive

Song Wang a, Wen Yue a,b,c, Zhiqiang Fu a, Chengbiao Wang a, Xingliang Li a, Jiajun Liu c

a School of Engineering and Technology, China University of Geosciences (Beijing), Beijing 100083, China
b Key Laboratory on Deep Geodrilling Technology of the Ministry of Land and Resources, China University of Geosciences (Beijing), Beijing 100083, China
c Department of Mechanical Engineering, Tsinghua University, Beijing 100084, China

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:
Received 3 April 2013
Received in revised form 27 May 2013
Accepted 4 June 2013
Available online 11 June 2013

Keywords:
Boundary lubrication
Lubricant additives
Tribochemistry
Ion implantation

ABSTRACT

The nitrided layer on 52100 steel was prepared by plasma nitriding treatment. The tribological behaviors were examined under lubrication with borate ester containing nitrogen (B-N). The nitrided steel exhibited a lower friction coefficient and smaller wear scar diameter compared with the untreated steel. When 1.25 wt% B-N was used, the friction coefficient and wear scar diameter of nitrided steel were reduced by 34% and 45%, respectively. The main mechanism of this effect was attributed to the fact that the B-N additive can produce a tribofilm containing higher content of BN on the nitrided surface.

In order to accommodate the working condition of the wind energy equipment exposed in open-air, the lubricating oil should be environment-friendly. In other words, the additives should not contain S and P elements and other harmful components in the molecular formula. As a kind of potential eco-friendly lubrication additive, B and N containing additives are of significant interest because of the desired intrinsic properties, including environment-acceptability, absence of S and P in the molecular formula, good anti-wear and friction-reducing properties and good hydrolytic stability [11–13]. Zheng et al. [14] synthesized several kinds of N-containing borate esters as additives. They found that borate esters having a stable five- or six-member ring possessed good hydrolytic stability and friction-reducing ability, and exhibited the best extreme pressure and anti-wear properties as well.

Greco et al. [15] found that the electrochemical boride surface and the nano-colloidal boron nitride lubricant additive showed an excellent synergistic effect in the wind turbine gearbox. Whether the nitrided surface lubricated with N-containing borate ester additives can also show such a good effect? In order to find the answer, a study on the tribological properties of plasma nitrided 52100 steel under lubrication with borate ester additives was carried out in this work. A new idea for improving the durability and efficiency of wind energy devices is proposed.

1. Introduction

For wind energy equipments, severe working conditions, such as high loading, unsteady operation, system vibration, system misalignment and exposure to the extreme environment, lead to the reduced durability and efficiency of some key components [1,2]. Improving the reliability of the devices is important to lower the cost of wind energy. Plasma nitriding is a widely used chemical heat treatment in mechanical equipments. This method can produce a compact and high hardness nitrided layer on the steel surface with improved fatigue, wear and corrosion resistance of work pieces [3]. Plasma nitriding is an effective way of fulfilling the requirements of the materials used for key components in wind energy equipments. In addition, an appropriate selection of lubrication additives is also important to the wind energy devices facing very harsh working conditions [4].

However, the majority of the lubrication additives were studied for Fe based material without surface modification, which is inconsistent with the real application. Whether the additives for Fe based material are still effective for the modified surface is worth studying. Some previous works about the tribochemical interactions between nitrided steel surface and base oils, like alkyl naphthalene, ionic liquid and liquid paraffin, and some additives, have been conducted [5–7]. It showed that the nitriding treatment can make large contribution to improving the friction and wear behaviors effectively [8–10].

2. Experimental details

AISI 52100 steel balls (with a diameter of 12.7 mm, hardness of 770 HV, and surface roughness Ra 0.025 μm) were nitrided in a pulsed plasma nitriding furnace (LDM2-25). The treatment...
proceeded at a temperature of 520 °C with a voltage of 700 V for a total duration of 5 h. NH3 is used as the source gas with a pressure of 670 Pa. Then the samples were cooled in vacuum to ambient temperature.

The friction and wear tests were carried out on an MS-10JR four-ball friction and a wear tester with a ball-to-ball contact configuration. The upper sample was a rotating ball fixed on the spindle, and the lower samples were three fixed balls. The four balls used in each test were selected as the same material. The friction and wear tests were conducted at a condition of load of 392 N (corresponding to the Hertz mean contact stress of 2.293 GPa), linear speed of 0.461 m/s, and test duration of 60 min. The minimum film thickness was determined using the Dowson and Hamrock minimum film thickness equation for an elastohydrodynamic point contact [16]. The lambda ratios (calculated minimum film thickness/initial composite surface root mean square roughness) for these tests were calculated as 0.812 and 0.13 for the untreated and nitrided surfaces, respectively. They are not the same but both are less than 1. Therefore, the lubrications on untreated and nitrided surfaces are in the boundary regime. The friction force and friction coefficient were measured by a force sensor and recorded by a computer. The wear scars were measured by a 15 J-type microscope. The tests were replicated at least three times. A good repeatability for the friction coefficients and wear scars in the whole process of the test was recorded and the results were averaged.

The base oil used was synthetic oil polyalphaolefin (PAO) whose kinematic viscosity was 16.7 mm² s⁻¹ at 40 °C. The main chemical composition of borate ester (B-N) is B 1.0 wt% and N 2.6 wt%. The density is 0.98 g cm⁻³ at room temperature. Two series of tests were carried out under lubrication of PAO with B-N additive. One was on the untreated surface, and another was on the nitrided surface. B-N's concentrations (mass fraction) in the tested oil were 0.0%, 0.25%, 0.5%, 0.75%, 1.0%, 1.5% and 2.0%.

The microhardness of the sample was measured by an MH-6 microhardness tester, and the applied load was 1.96 N with loading time of 5 s. The phase composition of the plasma nitrided layer was determined with a D-max/2550 X-ray diffractometer (XRD) in glancing angle geometry, using Cu Kα radiation as the excitation source. After the wear test, the samples were ultrasonically washed with petroleum ether and alcohol (the volume ratio 3:1). A JSM-6460LV scanning electron microscope (SEM) was utilized to observe the wear scar morphologies of the balls. The chemical states of tribofilms were investigated using a PHI Quantera X-ray photoelectron spectrocope (XPS). The instrument employed a high-power rotating anode and monochromatised Al Kα X-ray source. The tested sample surface was sputtered about 5 nm in depth by Ar ion (sputtering depth on the standard SiO₂ sample). The binding energy of 284.6 eV for contaminated C was used as a reference for charge correction.

3. Results and discussion

3.1. Characterization

Fig. 1 shows the SEM images of the untreated surface and the nitrided surface. It can be clearly seen that the spherical particles were piled up closely with a lot of fine micro-pores distributed on the nitrided surface (Fig. 1b), which resulted in a higher roughness Ra 0.16 μm. However, none was found on the untreated surface (Fig. 1a).

Fig. 2 shows the variation of the hardness of nitrided layer with the depth. The hardness of nitrided samples increased to 900–1000 HV with a distance of about 40 μm from the surface, and then decreased gradually to 500–600 HV when the distance from the surface reaches 40–140 μm. When the distance from the surface is larger than 140 μm, the hardness remained at a lower value.

From Fig. 3, it was found that the compositions of the nitrided sample were mainly γ-Fe₃N, ε-Fe₂₋₃N and CrN, while those of the untreated sample were martensite and austenite.

3.2. Friction and wear behavior

Fig. 4 shows the variations of friction coefficients of the untreated and nitrided surfaces with different concentrations of B-N. It indicated that the friction coefficients of the nitrided surface are always lower than those of the untreated surface under the same lubrication condition. The variation of the friction coefficients along with the increase of additive contents is irregular. Only when lubricated with 1.0 wt% and 1.25 wt% B-N, the friction coefficients of nitrided surface presented a sharp decrease to about 0.07, much lower than other concentrations. It may attribute to a friction reducing tribofilm formed on the nitrided surface lubricated with the proper B-N content.

Fig. 5 shows the variation of wear scar diameters with different concentrations of B-N. It can be seen that wear scar diameters on both surfaces were almost the same on untreated and nitrided surfaces in the lubrication of PAO. This results from the fact that the hardness of mating pairs was the same in each test [17]. The wear scar diameters of the untreated surface were almost unchanged for all concentrations, while those of nitrided surface were gradually reduced with the increase of B-N percentage. The minimum wear scar diameter reached 0.4 mm at the concentration of 1.25%, 45% less than that on the untreated surface. When the concentrations of the B-N continue to rise, the wear scar diameter on the nitrided surface increased again, but was still smaller than that on the substrate surface. It can be considered that there existed certainly a beneficial synergistic effect between the nitrided 52100 steel surfaces and B-N additive, which led to the improvement of wear-resistance through forming a protective tribofilm.

3.3. SEM analysis

In order to understand the difference of the friction-reducing and anti-wear mechanism of the B-N additives on the nitrided and the untreated surfaces, the wear surfaces were analyzed by SEM. Fig. 6 shows the SEM morphologies of the worn surfaces lubricated with PAO and 1.25 wt% B-N. So many deep furrows can be found on the surfaces of untreated and nitrided samples under the lubrication of PAO. It is obvious that the nitrided surface shows a smoother surface than the untreated ones under the same lubrication conditions. The furrows become obviously shallower as the addition of the additives. Compared with some corrosive pitting on the untreated surface lubricated with 1.25% B-N, the nitrided surface lubricated with 1.25% B-N shows the smoothest wear surface. This might be attributed to the excellent synergistic effect of borate ester and a higher hardness of the nitrided surface.

3.4. XPS analysis

The wear surfaces of the nitrided 52100 steel lubricated with different lubricants were analyzed by XPS so as to acquire more information about the tribochemical reaction involved during the sliding process, as shown in Fig. 7. Table 1 exhibits the elemental composition, determined by XPS quantitative analysis, of the tribofilm on the wear surface lubricated with 1.25% B-N. The binding energy values and quantifications of all the elements on the surface and the main components of the reference compounds [18] are listed in Table 2. It can be found that 9.45% B and 1.80%
were detected on the nitrided surface, while only 1.13% B and 0.47% N were present on the untreated surface. The binding energy of B 1s at 189.4 eV was corresponding to BN$_{x}$O$_{1-x}$, BN, and B$_2$O$_3$. The binding energy at 190.4 eV and 191.3 eV was corresponding to BN. And also, some different compounds were found on the two surfaces. On the untreated surface, the binding energy of C 1s corresponded to C at 284.6 eV and two organics at 285.4 eV and 287.8 eV. While on the nitrided surface, in addition to C at 284.6 eV and organic at 287.8 eV, Fe$_3$C and another organic were detected. Oxygen element existed in three chemical states on the untreated surface, namely Fe$_2$O$_3$ at 530.1 eV, FeOOH at 531.2 eV and BN$_{x}$O$_{1-x}$ at 532.6 eV. Additionally, another peak at 529.1 eV assigned to Fe$_2$O$_4$ was only found at the nitrided surface. The Fe2p signals exhibit two peaks, 2p1/2 and 2p3/2, due to spin-orbit splitting. The binding energy of the 2p1/2 peak was lower than the 2p3/2. The two peaks meet an area ratio of 1:2, and only the more prominent 2p3/2 signal was used for quantification. The main chemical states of Fe on the wear surfaces can be observed: FeO and Fe$_2$O$_3$ corresponding to 709.4 and 710.7 eV, as well as FeOOH at 711.8 eV. Fe (II)-satellite at 715.1 eV has only been detected on the untreated surface [19].

The most significant difference between the untreated surface and the nitrided surface was the content of different elements and compounds. It implies that different tribochemical reactions could occur on different surfaces. This results in more excellent friction-reduction and anti-wear effect for the nitrided sample than the untreated surface.
3.5. Discussion

In this study, the friction reduction and anti-wear properties on the untreated surface were compared with those on the nitrided surface. The results proved that the latter exhibited an obviously better performance. It implies that different mechanisms might occur on the different surfaces. One reason is that the nitrided layer could effectively increase the hardness of steel and improve its wear resistance and friction reduction. According to the above results in the wear test, the friction coefficient and the wear scar diameter of the nitrided surface are slightly lower than those of the untreated surface under the lubrication of PAO.

Furthermore, the tribofilm formed on the wear surface could play a more important role in improving the wear resistance and friction reduction under boundary lubrication. Much higher element concentrations of B and N were detected on the nitrided surface than that on the untreated surface. It implies that more friction reducing and anti-wear chemical compositions were produced on the nitrided surface. The XPS analyses revealed that only few B$_2$O$_3$ was found on the untreated surface. While on the nitrided rubbed surface, B element was found in three different chemical states. The formed boron-containing compounds were mainly organics, B$_2$O$_3$ and BN. BN possesses a lower shearing stress by its hexagonal structure and is widely used as a solid lubricant [16,20]. The other reaction products such as B$_2$O$_3$ and organics presented in this study possessed also the good wear resistance and friction reduction as reported in other literatures [14,21].

The content of B on the untreated surface was much lower than that on the nitrided surface even with the optimal concentration of B-N. Therefore, the reductions of wear scar diameter and friction coefficient on the untreated surface were not obvious with the increase of additive content. But on the nitrided surface, when the concentration of B-N is low, the BN formed on the contact region is insufficient to separate the counterpart surfaces. However, with the increase of B-N concentration, more BN and other lubricant compounds were produced on the frictional surfaces. This can sufficiently prevent the metallic asperities of both surfaces from directly contacting, thus the friction and wear decrease. While the concentration further increases, too much compounds were delivered to the contact area and lead to coagulation at the interface of rubbing-pair. This in turn causes the increase of friction force and unstable operation, even the local damage of tribofilm, and thus results in higher friction and wear.

A beneficially synergistic effect between the plasma nitrided AISI 52100 steel and nitrogen-containing borate ester was presented, as the electrochemical boride surface and the nano-colloidal boron nitride lubricant additive performed in Greco’s [15] work.
The increase of the surface hardness and the formation of an effective tribofilm lead to excellent tribological properties. The combination of surface treatment and lubricant additive would be beneficial in accommodating severe operating conditions and mitigating surface-originated failure.

4. Conclusions

The main conclusions can be drawn from this research as follows:

1. A beneficially synergistic effect between the plasma nitrided AISI 52100 steel and nitrogen-containing borate ester was observed.

---

**Table 1**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Atomic content</th>
<th>B (%)</th>
<th>C (%)</th>
<th>N (%)</th>
<th>O (%)</th>
<th>Fe (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.25% Untreated surface</td>
<td>1.13</td>
<td>65.80</td>
<td>0.47</td>
<td>29.85</td>
<td>2.76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.5% Nitried surface</td>
<td>4.70</td>
<td>46.15</td>
<td>2.05</td>
<td>41.34</td>
<td>5.77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.25% Nitried surface</td>
<td>9.45</td>
<td>48.79</td>
<td>1.80</td>
<td>37.21</td>
<td>2.75</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 2**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Elements</th>
<th>Untreated surface</th>
<th>Nitrated surface</th>
<th>Untreated surface</th>
<th>Nitrated surface</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>B 1s</td>
<td>189.4</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>BN, O(_{1-x})</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C 1s</td>
<td>284.6</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>Fe(_{2}C)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N 1s</td>
<td>397.5</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>Organic</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O 1s</td>
<td>530.1</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>Fe(<em>{2}O</em>{3})</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fe 2p</td>
<td>709.4</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>Fe(<em>{2}O</em>{3})</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Fig. 7. XPS spectra of different elements on the untreated and nitried surfaces under lubrication with B-N.
presented. The usage of PAO with 1.25 wt% B-N additive reduced the friction coefficient by 38% and wear scar diameter by 45% for nitrided surface, compared with those on the untreated surface.

(2) The higher hardness of nitrided surface and the formation of hexagonal BN and B2O3 in the tribofilm play an important role in reducing the friction and wear of bearing steel.

Acknowledgments

The authors would like to thank the Beijing Natural Science Foundation (3132023), the National Natural Science Foundation of China (51005218 and 51275494), the Fundamental Research Funds for the Central Universities and the Tribology Science Fund of State Key Laboratory of Tribology Tsinghua University (SKLTKF11B04) for their financial support to this research, and also thank engineer Haipeng Huang from R&D Center of SINOPEC Lubricant Company (Beijing) for providing the base oil and additives.

References

[18] (http://srdata.nist.gov/xps/).